# Mordell-Weil Groups of Elliptic Curves 

Caleb McWhorter<br>Syracuse University

Binghamton University
Arithmetic Seminar
November 25, 2019

## Theorem (Mordell, 1922)

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be an elliptic curve. Then the group of $\mathbb{Q}$-rational points on $E$, denoted $E(\mathbb{Q})$, is a finitely generated abelian group. In particular,

$$
E(\mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z}^{r_{\mathbb{Q}}} \oplus E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }},
$$

where $r_{\mathbb{Q}} \geq 0$ is the rank of $E$ and $E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}$ is the torsion subgroup.


Louis J. Mordell

## Theorem (Mordell-Weil, 1928)

Let $K$ be a number field, and let $A / K$ be an abelian variety. Then the group of K-rational points on $A$, denoted $A(K)$, is a finitely generated abelian group. In particular,

$$
A(K) \cong \mathbb{Z}^{r_{K}} \oplus A(K)_{\text {tors }}
$$

where $r_{K} \geq 0$ and $A(K)_{\text {tors }}$ is the torsion subgroup.


Louis J. Mordell


André Weil

## Theorem (Mordell-Weil-Néron, 1952)

Let $K$ be a field that is finitely generated over its prime field, and let $A / K$ be an abelian variety. Then the group of K-rational points on $A$, denoted $A(K)$, is a finitely generated abelian group. In particular,

$$
A(K) \cong \mathbb{Z}^{r_{K}} \oplus A(K)_{\text {tors }}
$$

where $r_{K} \geq 0$ is the rank and $A(K)_{\text {tors }}$ is the torsion subgroup.


Louis J. Mordell


André Weil


André Néron

## Question

What finitely generated abelian groups arise from abelian varieties over global fields?

## This depends on what we vary.

- Fix a global field $K$, and vary elliptic curves over $K$.

$$
E_{1}(K), \quad E_{2}(K), \quad \ldots \quad, \quad E_{n}(K), \quad \ldots
$$

- Fix a global field $K$, and vary elliptic curves over $K$.

$$
E_{1}(K), \quad E_{2}(K), \quad \ldots \quad, \quad E_{n}(K), \quad \ldots
$$

- Fix an elliptic curve defined over $F$, and vary over finite extensions $K / F$

where $K_{1}, K_{2}, \ldots, K_{n}, \ldots$ are in some family of finite extensions of $F$, contained in some fixed algebraic closure $\bar{F}$. Or vary over all elliptic curves over all extensions $\left\{K_{n}\right\}$.
- Fix a global field $K$, and vary elliptic curves over $K$.

$$
E_{1}(K), \quad E_{2}(K), \quad \ldots \quad, \quad E_{n}(K), \quad \ldots
$$

- Fix an elliptic curve defined over $F$, and vary over finite extensions $K / F$

where $K_{1}, K_{2}, \ldots, K_{n}, \ldots$ are in some family of finite extensions of $F$, contained in some fixed algebraic closure $\bar{F}$. Or vary over all elliptic curves over all extensions $\left\{K_{n}\right\}$.
- Take the previous question and replace $\left\{E_{n}(K)\right\}$ with an object of interest, e.g. $r_{K}, E_{n}(K)_{\text {tors, }}$ etc.

What are the possible ranks of elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ ?

| Rank | Year | Due To |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 3 | 1938 | Billing |
| 4 | 1945 | Wiman |
| 6 | 1974 | Penney/Pomerance |
| 7 | 1975 | Penney/Pomerance |
| 8 | 1977 | Grunewald/Zimmert |
| 9 | 1977 | Brumer/Kramer |
| 12 | 1982 | Mestre |
| 14 | 1986 | Mestre |
| 15 | 1992 | Mestre |
| 17 | 1992 | Nagao |
| 19 | 1992 | Fermigier |
| 20 | 1993 | Nagao |
| 21 | 1994 | Nagao/Kouya |
| 22 | 1997 | Fermigier |
| 23 | 1998 | Martin/McMillen |
| 24 | 2000 | Martin/McMillen |
| 28 | 2006 | Elkies |



Are the ranks of elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ unbounded?

## Some Heuristics

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

In particular, the $p$-adic Selmer group is modeled by the intersection between randomly chosen maximal isotropic subspaces in some large orthogonal spaces over $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$.

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

In particular, the $p$-adic Selmer group is modeled by the intersection between randomly chosen maximal isotropic subspaces in some large orthogonal spaces over $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$.

The model predicts...

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

In particular, the $p$-adic Selmer group is modeled by the intersection between randomly chosen maximal isotropic subspaces in some large orthogonal spaces over $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$.

The model predicts...

- $\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q})$ is 0 or 1 each with density $50 \%$.

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

In particular, the $p$-adic Selmer group is modeled by the intersection between randomly chosen maximal isotropic subspaces in some large orthogonal spaces over $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$.

The model predicts...

- $\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q})$ is 0 or 1 each with density $50 \%$.
- $\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q}) \geq 2$ with density $0 \%$.

New heuristics of Jennifer Park, Bjorn Poonen, John Voight, and Melanie Matchett Wood model the distribution of Selmer groups, Tate-Shafarevich groups, and Mordell-Weil groups of 'random' rational elliptic curves.

In particular, the $p$-adic Selmer group is modeled by the intersection between randomly chosen maximal isotropic subspaces in some large orthogonal spaces over $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$.

The model predicts...

- $\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q})$ is 0 or 1 each with density $50 \%$.
- $\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q}) \geq 2$ with density $0 \%$.
- Only finitely many elliptic curves over $\mathbb{Q}$ have rank $\geq 22$.

What is the 'average' rank of elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ ?

## What does 'average' mean here?

$\mathcal{A}:=$ Some property
$S_{n}:=$ set of objects up to size $n$.
$A_{n}:=$ set of objects in $S$ with property $\mathcal{A}$ in $S_{n}$.

$$
\mu(\mathcal{A})=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\left|A_{n}\right|}{\left|S_{n}\right|}
$$

We need two things:

- A notion of 'size' for elliptic curves.
- A way of counting the number of elliptic curves up to a given 'size.'

Fact. Any elliptic curve $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is isomorphic to an elliptic curve of the form

$$
E_{A, B}: y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B
$$

where $A, B \in \mathbb{Z}$.

Fact. Any elliptic curve $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is isomorphic to an elliptic curve of the form

$$
E_{A, B}: y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B
$$

where $A, B \in \mathbb{Z}$.
In fact, $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is isomorphic to a unique $E_{A, B}$ if we require that if $p^{4} \mid A$ then $p^{6}+B$.

There are many notions of 'size' (a.k.a. complexity) of an elliptic curve $E_{A, B}:=y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B$ :

- Naïve Height: $H\left(E_{A, B}\right):=\max \left\{|A|^{3},|B|^{2}\right\}$
- Falting's Height
- Discriminant, $\Delta_{E}: \Delta\left(E_{A, B}\right):=-16\left(4 A^{3}+27 B^{2}\right)$
- Conductor, $N_{E}:=\prod_{p \text { prime }} p^{f_{p}(E)}$, where

$$
f_{p}(E)= \begin{cases}0, & E \text { has good reduction at } p \\ 1, & E \text { has multiplicative reduction at } p \\ 2, & E \text { has additive reduction at } p\end{cases}
$$

The naïve height can also be defined as $H\left(E_{A, B}\right):=\max \left\{4|A|^{3}, 27 B^{2}\right\}$.

## Advantage of Naïve Height

Let $\mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}$ denote the set of isomorphism classes of elliptic curves of (naïve) height at most $X$.

## Advantage of Naïve Height

Let $\mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}$ denote the set of isomorphism classes of elliptic curves of (naïve) height at most $X$.

$$
\# \mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}=4 \zeta(10)^{-1} X^{5 / 6}+O\left(X^{1 / 2}\right)
$$

## Advantage of Naïve Height

Let $\mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}$ denote the set of isomorphism classes of elliptic curves of (naïve) height at most $X$.

$$
\# \mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}=4 \zeta(10)^{-1} X^{5 / 6}+O\left(X^{1 / 2}\right)
$$

This essentially comes from the fact that there are $X^{1 / 3}$ choices for $A$ and $X^{1 / 2}$ choices for $B$.

## Advantage of Naïve Height

Let $\mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}$ denote the set of isomorphism classes of elliptic curves of (naïve) height at most $X$.

$$
\# \mathcal{E}_{H \leq X}=4 \zeta(10)^{-1} X^{5 / 6}+O\left(X^{1 / 2}\right)
$$

This essentially comes from the fact that there are $X^{1 / 3}$ choices for $A$ and $X^{1 / 2}$ choices for $B$.

It is conjectured that all the measures of heights give the same order of magnitude for all but a 'small' proportion of elliptic curves.

## Conjecture (Goldfeld, Katz-Sarnak)

When ordered by height, the average rank of elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is $\frac{1}{2}$. More precisely, $50 \%$ of curves should have rank 0 and $50 \%$ of curves should have rank 1.


Dorian Goldfeld


Nick Katz


Peter Sarnak

# Prior to the conjecture, the average rank was not even known to be finite! 

# COMPUTATIONS OF BRUMER, MCGUINNESS, Bektemirov, Stein, Watkins 



Average rank of elliptic curves of conductor $\leq 10^{8}$. The average turns out to be $0.8664 \ldots$...

## Previously Known Results

1992: Assuming BSD \& GRH, Brumer showed the average rank is bounded (by 2.3).

## Previously Known Results

1992: Assuming BSD \& GRH, Brumer showed the average rank is bounded (by 2.3).

2004: Heath-Brown (assuming BSD, GRH) improved this average rank to $\leq 2.0$

## Previously Known Results

1992: Assuming BSD \& GRH, Brumer showed the average rank is bounded (by 2.3).

2004: Heath-Brown (assuming BSD, GRH) improved this average rank to $\leq 2.0$

2009: Young (assuming BSD, GRH) improved this to $\leq 25 / 14 \approx 1.786$.

# Is there a proof of boundedness (with an estimate) without assuming BSD, GRH? 



Manjul Bhargava


Arul Shankar

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

We do not know how to compute $E(\mathbb{Q})$, so we study the 'simpler' group $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$.

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

We do not know how to compute $E(\mathbb{Q})$, so we study the 'simpler' group $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$.

By the Mordell-Weil Theorem, we know that

$$
E(\mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z}^{r} \oplus E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}
$$

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

We do not know how to compute $E(\mathbb{Q})$, so we study the 'simpler' group $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$.

By the Mordell-Weil Theorem, we know that

$$
E(\mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z}^{r} \oplus E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}
$$

Then we must have

$$
E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q}) \cong(\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z})^{r} \oplus E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }} / n E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}
$$

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

If we knew $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$ and $E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}$, we could compute $r$.

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

If we knew $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$ and $E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}$, we could compute $r$.
Example. If $n=p$, then $\operatorname{dim}_{\mathbb{F}_{p}} E(\mathbb{Q}) / p E(\mathbb{Q})=\operatorname{dim}_{\mathbb{F}_{p}} E(\mathbb{Q})[p]+\operatorname{rank} E(\mathbb{Q})$

## SELMER \& SHAFAREVICH-TATE GROUPS

Define a computable group $S^{n}(E)$, called the Selmer group, containing $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$.

Define a computable group $S^{n}(E)$, called the Selmer group, containing $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$.

Approximate $E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q})$ by $S^{(n)}(E)$. We define an 'error term' $\amalg(E)$, called the Shafarevich-Tate group.

$$
0 \longrightarrow E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q}) \longrightarrow S^{(n)}(E) \longrightarrow \amalg[n] \longrightarrow 0
$$

## Definition

Let $\varphi: E / K \rightarrow E^{\prime} / K$ be an isogeny. The $\varphi$-Selmer group $E / K$ is the subgroup of $H^{1}\left(G_{\bar{K} / K}, E[\varphi]\right)$ defined by

$$
S^{(\varphi)}(E / K):=\operatorname{ker}\left\{H^{1}\left(G_{\bar{K} / K}, E[\varphi]\right) \longrightarrow \prod_{v \in M_{K}} \mathrm{WC}\left(E / K_{v}\right)\right\}
$$

The Shafarevich-Tate group of $E / K$ is the subgroup of $\mathrm{WC}(E / K)$ defined by

$$
\amalg(E / K):=\operatorname{ker}\left\{\mathrm{WC}(E / K) \longrightarrow \prod_{v \in M_{K}} \mathrm{WC}\left(E / K_{v}\right)\right\}
$$

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

$$
0 \longrightarrow E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q}) \longrightarrow S^{(n)}(E) \longrightarrow \amalg[n] \longrightarrow 0
$$

If $E(\mathbb{Q})[n]=\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then

$$
n^{\operatorname{rank} E} \leq\left|S^{(n)}(E)\right|
$$

## IDEA OF BHARGAVA-SHANKAR

$$
0 \longrightarrow E(\mathbb{Q}) / n E(\mathbb{Q}) \longrightarrow S^{(n)}(E) \longrightarrow \amalg[n] \longrightarrow 0
$$

If $E(\mathbb{Q})[n]=\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then

$$
n^{\operatorname{rank} E} \leq\left|S^{(n)}(E)\right|
$$

To prove boundedness of average rank, it is enough to show that the average size of $\left|S^{(n)}(E)\right|$ for any $n>1$.

## OUTLINE OF THE PROOF

1. For $n \leq 5$, construct a representation $V$ of an algebraic group $G$ defined over $\mathbb{Z}$ related to $A, B$.
2. Count the elements under the action of $G$ on $V$ with bounded $A, B$.
3. Sieve to count the elements of $S^{(n)}\left(E_{A, B}\right)$ 'in' the representation.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

Let $n=1,2,3,4,5$. When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average number of order $n$ elements in the $n$-Selmer group is $n$.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

Let $n=1,2,3,4,5$. When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average number of order $n$ elements in the $n$-Selmer group is $n$.

## Corollary

Let $n=1,2,3,4,5$. When ordered by height, the average size of the $n$-Selmer group for elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is $\sigma(n)$.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

Let $n=1,2,3,4,5$. When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average number of order $n$ elements in the $n$-Selmer group is $n$.

## Corollary

Let $n=1,2,3,4,5$. When ordered by height, the average size of the $n$-Selmer group for elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is $\sigma(n)$.

## Conjecture (Bhargava-Shankar)

Let $n \geq 1$. When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average size of the $n$-Selmer group is $\sigma(n)$.

## Proposition (Bhargava-Shankar)

If the previous conjecture is true for all $n$, then when elliptic curves are ordered by height, a density of $100 \%$ of elliptic curves have rank 0 or 1 .

Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)
When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average rank is bounded (by $0.885<1$ ).

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, the average rank is bounded (by $0.885<1$ ).

## Corollary

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have rank 0.

## Corollary

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, more than $80 \%$ have rank 0 or 1.

Theorem (Bhargava, Shankar, Skinner)
When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have rank 1.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 0.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 0.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 1.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 0.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 1.

## Corollary

A positive proportion of elliptic curves satisfy the BSD conjecture.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 0.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar)

When elliptic curves $E / \mathbb{Q}$ are ordered by height, a positive proportion have analytic rank 1.

## Corollary

A positive proportion of elliptic curves satisfy the BSD conjecture.

## Theorem (Bhargava-Shankar-Zhang)

More than $66 \%$ of elliptic curves have analytic rank 0 or 1, and thus satisfy BSD.

## What about Torsion?

## Theorem (Levi-Ogg Conjecture; Mazur, 1977)

If $E / \mathbb{Q}$ is a rational elliptic curve, then the possible torsion subgroups $E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text {tors }}$ are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 4\end{cases}
$$

Furthermore, each possibility occurs infinitely often.


Beppo Levi


Andrew Ogg


Barry Mazur

What about the groups $E(K)_{\text {tors, }}$, where $K$ is a number field of degree $d$ ?

With massive loss of generality, let $d=2$

## Theorem (Kenku, Momose, 1988; Kamienny, 1992)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a quadratic number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 16,18 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 6 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 3 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 3 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 4 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 4 \mathbb{Z} & \end{cases}
$$

Moreover, each possibility occurs infinitely often.


Monsur Kenku


Fumiyuki Momose


Sheldon Kamienny

## Theorem (Jeon,Kim,Schweizer, 2004; <br> Etropolski-Morrow-Zureick Brown; Derickx, 2016)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a cubic number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 16,18,20,21 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 7\end{cases}
$$

Each of these possibilities occurs infinitely many times except $\mathbb{Z} / 21 \mathbb{Z}$.


## Theorem (Jeon, Kim, Park, 2006)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a quartic number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ appearing infinitely often are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 18,20,21,22 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 9 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 3 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 3 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,3 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 4 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 4 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 5 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 5 \mathbb{Z} & \\ \mathbb{Z} / 6 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 6 \mathbb{Z} & \end{cases}
$$



Daeyeol Jeon


Chang Kim


Eui-Sung Park

## Theorem (Derickx, Sutherland, 2016)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a quintic number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ appearing infinitely often are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 22,24,25 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 8\end{cases}
$$



Maarten Derickx


Drew Sutherland

## Theorem (Derickx, Sutherland, 2016)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a sextic number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ appearing infinitely often are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 30 ; n \neq 23,25,29 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 10 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 3 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 3 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 4 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 4 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 4 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 6 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 6 \mathbb{Z} & \end{cases}
$$



Maarten Derickx


Drew Sutherland

## What about CM Elliptic Curves?

## Theorem (Clark, Corn, Rice, Stankewicz; 2013)

Let $K$ be a number field of degree $d=1,2, \ldots, 13$ and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve with CM. Then all possible torsion subgroups are given, and an algorithm to compute the list.


Pete Clark


Patrick Corn


Alex Rice


James Stankewicz

## Theorem (Bourdon, Pollack; 2018)

Let $K$ be an odd degree number field and $E / K$ be an elliptic curve with $C M$. Then the torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are computable.


Abbey Bourdon


Paul Pollack

## What about Rational Elliptic Curves

Theorem (Fricke, Kenku, Klein, Kubert, Ligozat, Mazur, Ogg, et al.)
If $E / \mathbb{Q}$ has an n-isogeny over $\mathbb{Q}$, then

$$
n \in\{1,2, \ldots, 19,21,25,27,37,43,67,163\} .
$$

If $E$ does not have $C M$, then $n \leq 18$ or $n \in\{21,25,37\}$.

## Theorem (Chou,Daniels,González-Jimenez,LozanoRobledo,Najman,Tornero,et al.)

Let $\mathcal{C}_{n}$ denote the cyclic subgroup of order $n$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\Phi_{\mathbb{Q}}(2)= & \left\{\mathcal{C}_{n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12,15,16\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{2} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{2 n}: 1,2, \ldots, 6\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{3} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{3}, \mathcal{C}_{3} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{6}, \mathcal{C}_{4} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{4}\right\} \\
\Phi_{\mathbb{Q}}(3)= & \left\{\mathcal{C}_{n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12,13,14,18,21\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{2} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{2 n}: n=1,2,3,4,7\right\} \\
\Phi_{\mathbb{Q}}(4)= & \left\{\mathcal{C}_{n}: n=12, \ldots, 10,12,13,15,16,20,24\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{2} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{2 n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 6,8\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{3} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{3 n}: n=1,2\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{4} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{4 n}: n=1,2\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{5} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{5}\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{6} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{6}\right\} \\
\Phi_{\mathbb{Q}}(5)=\{ & \left\{\mathcal{C}_{n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 12,25\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{2} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{2 n}: n=1,2,3,4\right\} \\
\Phi_{\mathbb{Q}}(6) \supseteq & \left\{\mathcal{C}_{n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 21,30: n \neq 11,17,19,20\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{2} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{2 n}: n=1,2, \ldots, 7,9\right\} \\
& \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{3} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{3 n}: n=1,2,3,4\right\} \cup\left\{\mathcal{C}_{4} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{4}, \mathcal{C}_{6} \oplus \mathcal{C}_{6}\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$



Michael Chou


Álvaro Lozano-Robledo


Harris Daniels


Filip Najman


Enrique González-Jiménez


José Tornero

The Result for Nonic Galois Fields

## Theorem (M.)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12,13,14,18,19,21,27 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,3,4,7\end{cases}
$$

## Theorem (M.)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 3 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 3 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are precisely:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12,13,14,18,21 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,3,4,7\end{cases}
$$

## Theorem (M.)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then the possible torsion subgroups $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ are:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2, \ldots, 10,12,13^{*}, 18^{*}, 19,21,27 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,3,4\end{cases}
$$

Outline of the Method

## Step 1. Determine the Possible Prime Orders

## Theorem (Lozano-Robledo)

Let $S_{\mathbb{Q}}(d)$ be the set of primes such that there exists an elliptic curve $E / \mathbb{Q}$ with a point of order $p$ defined in an extension $K / \mathbb{Q}$ of degree at most $d$. Then $S_{\mathbb{Q}}(9)=\{2,3,5,7,11,13,17,19\}$.


Álvaro Lozano-Robledo

## Remark

Lozano-Robledo computes $S_{\mathbb{Q}}(d)$ for $1 \leq d \leq 21$, and gives a conjecturally formula valid for all $1 \leq d \leq 42$, following from a positive answer to Serre's uniformity question.

## Proposition (González-Jiménez, Najman)

i $11 \in R_{\mathbb{Q}}(d)$ if and only if $5 \mid d$.
ii $13 \in R_{\mathbb{Q}}(d)$ if and only if $3 \mid d$ or $4 \mid d$.
iii $17 \in R_{\mathbb{Q}}(d)$ if and only if $8 \mid d$.


Enrique González-Jiménez


Filip Najman

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then if $P \in E(K)$ is a point of prime order $p$, then $p \in\{2,3,5,7,13,19\}$.

## Step 2. Bound the Size of the Sylow Subgroups

## Lemma

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be an odd degree number field, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain full p-torsion for all odd primes.

Lemma
Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a Galois extension, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. If $E(K)[n] \cong \mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}$, then $E$ has a rational n-isogeny.

Theorem (Fricke, Kenku, Klein, Kubert, Ligozat, Mazur, Ogg, et al.)
If $E / \mathbb{Q}$ has an n-isogeny over $\mathbb{Q}$, then

$$
n \in\{1,2, \ldots, 19,21,25,27,37,43,67,163\} .
$$

If $E$ does not have $C M$, then $n \leq 18$ or $n \in\{21,25,37\}$.

## Lemma

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
E(K)\left[3^{\infty}\right] & \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 27 \mathbb{Z} \\
E(K)\left[\left[^{\infty}\right]\right. & \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 25 \mathbb{Z} \\
E(K)\left[7^{\infty}\right] & \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 7 \mathbb{Z} \\
E(K)\left[13^{\infty}\right] & \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 13 \mathbb{Z} \\
E(K)\left[1^{\infty}\right] & \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 19 \mathbb{Z}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Theorem (Rouse,Zureick-Brown, 2015)

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve without $C M$. Then the index of $\rho_{E, 2^{\infty}}(\operatorname{Gal}(\overline{\mathbb{Q}} / \mathbb{Q}))$ divides 64 or 96 , and all such indices occur. Furthermore, the image of $\rho_{E, 2 \infty}(\operatorname{Gal}(\overline{\mathbb{Q}} / \mathbb{Q}))$ is the inverse image in $\mathrm{GL}_{2}\left(\mathbb{Z}_{2}\right)$ of the image of $\rho_{E, 32}(\operatorname{Gal}(\overline{\mathbb{Q}} / \mathbb{Q}))$.


Jeremy Rouse


David Zureick-Brown

## Remark

They also enumerate all 1,208 possibilities and find their rational points.

## Theorem (González-Jiménez, Lozano-Robledo)

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be an elliptic curve without $C M$. Let $1 \leq s \leq N$ be fixed integers, and let $T \subseteq E\left[2^{N}\right]$ be a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 2^{s} / Z \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2^{N} \mathbb{Z}$. Then $[\mathbb{Q}(T): \mathbb{Q}]$ is divisible by 2 if $s=N=2$, and otherwise by $2^{2 N+2 s-8}$ if $N \geq 3$, unless $s \geq 4$ and $j(E)$ is one of the two values:

$$
-\frac{3 \cdot 18249920^{3}}{17^{16}} \text { or }-\frac{7 \cdot 1723187806080^{3}}{79^{16}}
$$

in which case $[\mathbb{Q}(T): \mathbb{Q}]$ is divisible by $3 \cdot 2^{2 N+2 s-9}$. Moreover, this is best possible in that there are one-parameter families $E_{s, N}(t)$ of elliptic curves over $\mathbb{Q}$ such that for each $s, N \geq 0$ and each $t \in \mathbb{Q}$, and subgroups $T_{s, N} \in E_{s, N}(t)(\overline{\mathbb{Q}})$ isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 2^{s} \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2^{N} \mathbb{Z}$ such that $\left[\mathbb{Q}\left(T_{s, N}\right): \mathbb{Q}\right]$ is equal to the bound given above.

## Lemma

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)\left[2^{\infty}\right] \subseteq \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then
$E(K)_{\text {tors }} \subseteq(\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}) \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 27 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 25 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 7 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 13 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 19 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Step 3. Eliminate Possibilities

## Lemma

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Let $P \in E(K)$ be a point of order $p$.

1. If $p=2,3,5$, then $P$ is rational or defined over a cubic field.
2. If $p=7,13,19$, then $P$ is defined over a cubic field.

## Lemma (Najman)

Let $p, q$ be distinct odd primes, $F_{2} / F_{1}$ a Galois extension of number fields such that $\operatorname{Gal}\left(F_{2} / F_{1}\right) \simeq \mathbb{Z} / q \mathbb{Z}$ and $E / F_{1}$ an elliptic curve with no $p$-torsion over $F_{1}$. Then if $q$ does not divide $p-1$ and $\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{p}\right) \not \subset F_{2}$, then $E\left(F_{2}\right)[p]=0$.

## Lemma (Najman)

Let $p$ be an odd prime number, $q$ a prime not dividing $p, F_{2} / F_{1}$ a Galois extension of number fields such that $\operatorname{Gal}\left(F_{2} / F_{1}\right) \simeq \mathbb{Z} / q \mathbb{Z}$, $E / F_{1}$ an elliptic curve, and suppose $E\left(F_{1}\right) \supset \mathbb{Z} / p \mathbb{Z}, E\left(F_{1}\right) \not \supset \mathbb{Z} / p^{2} \mathbb{Z}$, and $\zeta_{p} \notin F_{2}$. Then $E\left(F_{2}\right) \not \supset \mathbb{Z} / p^{2} \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition (Najman)

Let $K$ be a cubic field. Then the 5-Sylow groups of $E(\mathbb{Q})$ and $E(K)$ are equal.

## Proposition (Najman)

Let $K$ be a cubic field. Then the 5-Sylow groups of $E(\mathbb{Q})$ and $E(K)$ are equal.

## Proposition (Najman)

If the torsion subgroup of an elliptic curve $E$ over $\mathbb{Q}$ has a nontrivial 2-Sylow subgroup, then over any number field of odd degree the torsion of E will have the same 2-Sylow subgroup as over $\mathbb{Q}$.

## Proposition (Najman)

Let $K$ be a cubic field. Then the 5-Sylow groups of $E(\mathbb{Q})$ and $E(K)$ are equal.

## Proposition (Najman)

If the torsion subgroup of an elliptic curve E over $\mathbb{Q}$ has a nontrivial 2-Sylow subgroup, then over any number field of odd degree the torsion of E will have the same 2-Sylow subgroup as over $\mathbb{Q}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Let $F$ be cubic subfield of K. If the 2-Sylow subgroup of $E(F)_{\text {tors }}$ is nontrivial, then $E(K)\left[2^{\infty}\right]=E(F)\left[2^{\infty}\right]$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 10 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 10 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 15 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proof.

- We know $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ is not an option.


## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proof.

- We know $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ is not an option.
- If $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \neq\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \supseteq \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.
- $E(K)[16] \cong \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ so $E$ has a 16 -isogeny.


## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof.

- We know $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ is not an option.
- If $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \neq\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \supseteq \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.
- $E(K)[16] \cong \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ so $E$ has a 16 -isogeny.
- Choose a model $E: y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B$.
- Then $\mathbb{Q}\left(x^{3}+A x+B\right) \subseteq K$ is a cubic field.


## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof.

- We know $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ is not an option.
- If $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \neq\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \supseteq \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.
- $E(K)[16] \cong \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ so $E$ has a 16 -isogeny.
- Choose a model $E: y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B$.
- Then $\mathbb{Q}\left(x^{3}+A x+B\right) \subseteq K$ is a cubic field.
- We must have $\operatorname{disc} f(x)=\square$.


## Proposition

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve, and let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain $\mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof.

- We know $\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ is not an option.
- If $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \neq\{\mathcal{O}\}$, then $E(\mathbb{Q})\left[2^{\infty}\right] \supseteq \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$.
- $E(K)[16] \cong \mathbb{Z} / 16 \mathbb{Z}$ so $E$ has a 16 -isogeny.
- Choose a model $E: y^{2}=x^{3}+A x+B$.
- Then $\mathbb{Q}\left(x^{3}+A x+B\right) \subseteq K$ is a cubic field.
- We must have $\operatorname{disc} f(x)=\square$.
- $j=\frac{\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{h^{4}\left(h^{4}-16\right)}$ for $h \in \mathbb{Q} \backslash\{0, \pm 2\}$.

For $h \in \mathbb{Q} \backslash\{0, \pm 2\}, E$ must be

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}-\frac{27\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}} x+\frac{54\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}}
$$

For $h \in \mathbb{Q} \backslash\{0, \pm 2\}, E$ must be

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}-\frac{27\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}} x+\frac{54\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}}
$$

Its discriminant must be a square, so

$$
M^{2}=\frac{136048896 h^{4}\left(h^{4}-16\right)\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{6}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{6}}
$$

For $h \in \mathbb{Q} \backslash\{0, \pm 2\}, E$ must be

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}-\frac{27\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}} x+\frac{54\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}}
$$

Its discriminant must be a square, so

$$
M^{2}=\frac{136048896 h^{4}\left(h^{4}-16\right)\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{6}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{6}}
$$

Any solution is a subset of the rational points on the curve

$$
X: y^{2}=h^{4}-16
$$

For $h \in \mathbb{Q} \backslash\{0, \pm 2\}, E$ must be

$$
y^{2}=x^{3}-\frac{27\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}} x+\frac{54\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{3}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{2}}
$$

Its discriminant must be a square, so

$$
M^{2}=\frac{136048896 h^{4}\left(h^{4}-16\right)\left(h^{8}-16 h^{4}+16\right)^{6}}{\left(h^{12}-24 h^{8}+120 h^{4}+64\right)^{6}}
$$

Any solution is a subset of the rational points on the curve

$$
X: y^{2}=h^{4}-16
$$

$X(\mathbb{Q})=\{\mathcal{O},(8,24),(0,8),(-4,0),(0,-8),(8,-24)\}$, none of which are solutions.

Nonic Bicyclic Galois Fields

## Theorem (Daniels, Lozano-Robledo, Najman, Sutherland, 2017)

Let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E\left(\mathbb{Q}\left(3^{\infty}\right)\right)_{\text {tors }}$ is finite and is isomorphic to one of the following:

$$
\begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,4,5,7,8,13 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 4 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} 4 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,4,7 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 6 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 6 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1,2,3,5,7 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=4,6,7,9\end{cases}
$$



Harris Daniels


Álvaro Lozano-Robledo


Filip Najman


Drew Sutherland

## Theorem (Najman)

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a cubic number field, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then

$$
E(F)_{\text {tors }} \cong \begin{cases}\mathbb{Z} / n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 10,12,13,14,18,21 \\ \mathbb{Z} / 2 \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} / 2 n \mathbb{Z}, & n=1, \ldots, 4,7\end{cases}
$$

Moreover, the elliptic curve 162 B1 over $\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{9}\right)^{+}$is the unique rational elliptic curve over a cubic number field with torsion subgroup $\mathbb{Z} / 21 \mathbb{Z}$.


Filip Najman

Nonic Cyclic Galois Fields

## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14-isogeny.


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.
- Using division polynomials, it must be that $F=\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{7}\right)^{+}$.


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.
- Using division polynomials, it must be that $F=\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{7}\right)^{+}$.
- $F \subseteq K \subseteq \mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{N}\right)$ for some $N=7^{s} m$.


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.
- Using division polynomials, it must be that $F=\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{7}\right)^{+}$.
- $F \subseteq K \subseteq \mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{N}\right)$ for some $N=7^{s} m$.
- $\left|\left(\mathbb{Z} / 7^{s} \mathbb{Z}\right)^{\times}\right|=7^{s-1}(7-1)=6 \cdot 7^{s-1}=2 \cdot 3 \cdot 7^{s-1}$


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.
- Using division polynomials, it must be that $F=\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{7}\right)^{+}$.
- $F \subseteq K \subseteq \mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{N}\right)$ for some $N=7^{s} m$.
- $\left|\left(\mathbb{Z} / 7^{s} \mathbb{Z}\right)^{\times}\right|=7^{s-1}(7-1)=6 \cdot 7^{s-1}=2 \cdot 3 \cdot 7^{s-1}$
- CRT produces $u \in \mathbb{N}$ with $\zeta_{N} \mapsto \zeta_{N}^{u}$ automorphism of $K$ of order 3


## Proposition

Let $K / \mathbb{Q}$ be a nonic Galois field with $\operatorname{Gal}(K / \mathbb{Q}) \cong \mathbb{Z} / 9 \mathbb{Z}$, and let $E / \mathbb{Q}$ be a rational elliptic curve. Then $E(K)_{\text {tors }}$ does not contain a subgroup isomorphic to $\mathbb{Z} / 14 \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof (Sketch).

- Assume $K / F / \mathbb{Q}$ exists. Then $E(K)$ has a 14 -isogeny.
- Then $E$ has $j$-invariant $j=-3^{3} \cdot 5^{3}$ or $3^{3} \cdot 5^{3} \cdot 17^{3}$, so $E$ must be the latter.
- Using division polynomials, it must be that $F=\mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{7}\right)^{+}$.
- $F \subseteq K \subseteq \mathbb{Q}\left(\zeta_{N}\right)$ for some $N=7^{s} m$.
- $\left|\left(\mathbb{Z} / 7^{s} \mathbb{Z}\right)^{\times}\right|=7^{s-1}(7-1)=6 \cdot 7^{s-1}=2 \cdot 3 \cdot 7^{s-1}$
- CRT produces $u \in \mathbb{N}$ with $\zeta_{N} \mapsto \zeta_{N}^{u}$ automorphism of $K$ of order 3
- $\zeta_{N} \mapsto \zeta_{N}^{u}$ non-trivial in $F, K$, contradiction

Questions?

